

Message

---

**From:** Durno, Mark [durno.mark@epa.gov]  
**Sent:** 1/6/2017 3:01:48 PM  
**To:** Johnson, Mark [johnson.mark@epa.gov]; Geyer, Rebecca [geyer.rebecca@epa.gov]; Russell, Diane [russell.diane@epa.gov]; Deltoral, Miguel [deltoral.miguel@epa.gov]  
**Subject:** FW: Questions regarding UM Filter Study Community Risk Communications

For awareness.....

md

---

**Mark Durno**

Homeland Security Advisor / Deputy Chief  
 Emergency Response Branch  
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
 25063 Center Ridge Road  
 Westlake, OH 44145  
 440-250-1743

---

**From:** Cupal, Suzanne [mailto:scupal@gchd.us]  
**Sent:** Thursday, January 05, 2017 12:48 PM  
**To:** Durno, Mark <durno.mark@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** FW: Questions regarding UM Filter Study Community Risk Communications

See below...

Suzanne Cupal, M.P.H.  
 Public Health Division Director  
 Genesee County Health Department  
 630 S. Saginaw Street  
 Suite 4  
 Flint, MI 48502  
 (810) 768-7970  
[scupal@gchd.us](mailto:scupal@gchd.us)

---

**From:** Shawn McElmurry [mailto:s.mcelmurry@wayne.edu]  
**Sent:** Thursday, January 05, 2017 12:46 PM  
**To:** Wells, Eden (DHHS); Nancy Love  
**Cc:** Zervos, Marcus; LyonCallo, Sarah (DHHS); Paul Kilgore; Matthew Seeger; Cupal, Suzanne; Valacak, Mark; Henry, James  
**Subject:** RE: Questions regarding UM Filter Study Community Risk Communications

Hey Eden, thanks for the email. Very important questions you raise and these are certainly questions we are trying to resolve, from our perspective at least, as quickly as possible. Below are my quick responses to your questions. I realize this isn't as definitive as we would all like, but it's an honest assessment of where we are at. Happy to discuss more on Friday.

Will you be in Chicago Tuesday?

Shawn

**From:** Wells, Eden (DHHS) [mailto:WellsE3@michigan.gov]

**Sent:** Thursday, January 05, 2017 11:59 AM

**To:** Shawn McElmurry <s.mcelmurry@wayne.edu>; Nancy Love <nglove@umich.edu>

**Cc:** Zervos, Marcus <mzervos1@hfhs.org>; LyonCallo, Sarah (DHHS) <lyoncallos@michigan.gov>; Paul Kilgore <paul.kilgore@wayne.edu>; Matthew Seeger <matthew.seeger@wayne.edu>; Cupal, Suzanne (scupal@gchd.us) <scupal@gchd.us>; Valacak, Mark <MVALACAK@gchd.us>; Henry, James <jhenry@gchd.us>

**Subject:** Questions regarding UM Filter Study Community Risk Communications

**Importance:** High

Dear Nancy and Shawn,

I raised the issue on Tuesday with Paul, had not heard back, but I thought that I would loop you in, Nancy, as next week there are a number of meetings occurring in Chicago and the Flint Community, and I want to be clear on a couple of issues beforehand. In addition, I do see that you all are beginning to develop abstracts and public/academic presentations based on the same information you presented to Flint on December 14. In reviewing your slides earlier in the week, I raised some questions. Please see my highlighted area below, and I am looping GCHD as well as the communications affects their agency also. ***Please address my questions below ASAP as these have important ramifications to public health and ongoing risk communications, and we can work with our communications teams:***

1. Again, it seems there is an intimation that your findings indicate that there is a current threat to public health. Is there (again, see my highlighted area below, but are you linking your findings to the resident reporting of skin or respiratory illnesses?) **If so:**
  - a. What is the threat? ((is it more than what we already know about bacteria and filters from past studies in other areas of the state and country?) - *Unknown, but we are still investigating.*
  - b. Is the threat isolated to Flint, or to all users of filters in any county or state? *Unknown. We have additional data from other water systems (Detroit and Ann Arbor) - it appears there are some differences (e.g. preliminary results of live cell counts appear to be greater in Flint) but this work is ongoing and we cannot yet draw final conclusions.*
2. Are you making recommendations to flush for one minute at this time in Flint? **If so:**
  - a. Should this be done by any user of a filter anywhere in MI? - *Based on our preliminary evidence, we believe that residents in Flint and elsewhere should flush their filters for at least 30 seconds prior to use. This is longer than what the manufacturers currently recommend but is consistent with US EPA recommendation for PoU devices*
  - b. What risk to health is being mitigated by the flushing? - *Unknown; however, we do know that cell counts (HPC and flow cytometry) go down with flushing.*
  - c. Is there a communications plan for such a recommendation? - *We are currently developing a fact sheet that we will share with our public health and community partners before it is released.*

Thank you for consideration of a rapid response—again, I am being approached by others about potential public health implications being raised. We can do a call if need be. I will be following up shortly.

Eden

Eden V. Wells, MD, MPH, FACPM  
Chief Medical Executive  
Michigan Department of Health and Human Services  
P.O. Box 30195  
Lansing, MI 48909  
(517)-284-4998

---

**From:** Paul Kilgore [mailto:[paul.kilgore@wayne.edu](mailto:paul.kilgore@wayne.edu)]

**Sent:** Tuesday, January 03, 2017 3:01 PM

**To:** Wells, Eden (DHHS) <[WellsE3@michigan.gov](mailto:WellsE3@michigan.gov)>; LyonCallo, Sarah (DHHS) <[lyoncallos@michigan.gov](mailto:lyoncallos@michigan.gov)>

**Cc:** Zervos, Marcus <[mzervos1@hfhs.org](mailto:mzervos1@hfhs.org)>; Shawn McElmurry <[s.mcelmurry@wayne.edu](mailto:s.mcelmurry@wayne.edu)>; Abdulbaset Salim <[asalim@med.wayne.edu](mailto:asalim@med.wayne.edu)>

**Subject:** Re: Descriptive abstract---anticipating submission to CSTE

Hi Eden thank you. For your question on slide 21, I will confer with Shawn and Mark. The CSTE abstract will focus on descriptive presentation of disease trends and entirely on Legionnaires' disease trends. So this paper is very simple and does not include analysis to look at associations that you note below. Thanks so much for your thoughtful questions.

Paul E. Kilgore, MPH, MD

Associate Professor, Department of Pharmacy Practice

Director of Research, Department of Pharmacy Practice

Eugene Applebaum College of Pharmacy and Health Sciences

Adjunct Professor, Department of Family Medicine and Public Health Sciences, School of Medicine

Wayne State University

Address:

259 Mack Ave., Room 2156

Detroit, Michigan 48201

Phone: (313) 577-1215

Cell: (248) 403-0275

Fax: (313) 577-5369

Skype: drpaulwsu

---

**From:** Wells, Eden (DHHS) <[WellsE3@michigan.gov](mailto:WellsE3@michigan.gov)>

**Sent:** Tuesday, January 3, 2017 2:18:15 PM

**To:** LyonCallo, Sarah (DHHS); Paul Kilgore

**Cc:** Zervos, Marcus; Shawn McElmurry; Abdulbaset Salim

**Subject:** RE: Descriptive abstract---anticipating submission to CSTE

I had a questions from your slide set from the open meeting slides---

It states on slide 21 that "many residents in Flint continue to report skin and lung illnesses."

Do you have data to support this, and, if there is, how does it relate regarding either your Legionella or Enterbactereciae filters studies? In other words, a question I would have is are there increased hospitalizations for pneumonia (above normal seasonal trends), or evidence of any bacteria-related skin diseases? If you have any such information please advise and it would need to be in the abstract, I would think if you state the same in your abstract---it seems you are trying to draw a direct link of your findings to current disease activity in the studied community, and I had not been aware there was a direct link.

Studies to date have not shown any evidence of bacterial skin diseases, or epidemiology consistent with water- or filter-borne Shigella, to my knowledge.

That would be important regarding how you address this potential association in your abstract.

Eden

Eden V. Wells, MD, MPH, FACPM  
 Chief Medical Executive  
 Michigan Department of Health and Human Services  
 P.O. Box 30195  
 Lansing, MI 48909  
 (517)-284-4998

---

**From:** LyonCallo, Sarah (DHHS)  
**Sent:** Tuesday, January 03, 2017 1:56 PM  
**To:** Paul Kilgore <[paul.kilgore@wayne.edu](mailto:paul.kilgore@wayne.edu)>; Wells, Eden (DHHS) <[WellsE3@michigan.gov](mailto:WellsE3@michigan.gov)>  
**Cc:** Zervos, Marcus <[mzervos1@hfhs.org](mailto:mzervos1@hfhs.org)>; Shawn McElmurry <[s.mcelmurry@wayne.edu](mailto:s.mcelmurry@wayne.edu)>; Abdulbaset Salim <[asalim@med.wayne.edu](mailto:asalim@med.wayne.edu)>  
**Subject:** RE: Descriptive abstract---anticipating submission to CSTE

Hi Paul

This will be answered in the abstract but do you mean data from December public meeting materials? Or what you presented to the student class at UM?

Sarah

---

**From:** Paul Kilgore [<mailto:paul.kilgore@wayne.edu>]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, January 03, 2017 12:46 PM  
**To:** LyonCallo, Sarah (DHHS) <[lyoncallos@michigan.gov](mailto:lyoncallos@michigan.gov)>; Wells, Eden (DHHS) <[WellsE3@michigan.gov](mailto:WellsE3@michigan.gov)>  
**Cc:** Zervos, Marcus <[mzervos1@hfhs.org](mailto:mzervos1@hfhs.org)>; Shawn McElmurry <[s.mcelmurry@wayne.edu](mailto:s.mcelmurry@wayne.edu)>; Abdulbaset Salim <[asalim@med.wayne.edu](mailto:asalim@med.wayne.edu)>  
**Subject:** Descriptive abstract---anticipating submission to CSTE

Hi Sarah and Eden

Wanted to get heads up to you regarding submission of abstract for the CSTE meeting. Will send the draft to you this afternoon. It will focus on the info sent earlier in Dec 2016 in the Excel file and PPT figures. Thank you.

Paul E. Kilgore, MPH, MD  
 Associate Professor, Department of Pharmacy Practice  
 Director of Research, Department of Pharmacy Practice  
 Eugene Applebaum College of Pharmacy and Health Sciences  
 Adjunct Professor, Department of Family Medicine and Public Health Sciences, School of Medicine  
 Wayne State University

Address:  
 259 Mack Ave., Room 2156

Detroit, Michigan 48201

Phone: (313) 577-1215

Cell: (248) 403-0275

Fax: (313) 577-5369

Skype: drpaulwsu